

貿易による平和：ロシア・ウクライナと 中国・台湾の比較分析

張 婷 婷

(台湾・銘伝大学国際事務修士及び外交学士プログラム助理教授)

【要約】

ノーベル経済学賞受賞者のポール・クルーグマンは、ニューヨーク・タイムズへの寄稿文で、西側諸国は第二次世界大戦以降、軍事衝突を回避するために相互依存型の世界貿易システム構築を掲げて取り組んできたが、ロシアのウクライナ侵略や中国の台湾に対する軍事的脅威が拡大する中で、その説得力を徐々に失っているようにだと論じた。またリアリズムと地政学は、ロシア・ウクライナ間と中台間において、経済依存の限界と貿易の非対称性ゆえに、平和を維持することはできないと指摘する。よって本研究では、リアリズムと地政学による批判的視点から、ロシア・ウクライナ間と中台間の貿易の影響と変化を比較した。結果、ロシア・ウクライナ間と中台間には、経済依存の限界と貿易の非対称性が確かに存在することを示した。中台貿易関係は長年にわたり緩やかに成長し、大きな変動がないのに対し、ウクライナでは発展戦略の変更により、ロシアとの経済貿易関係と政治的関係に影響が生じた。台湾海峡において安定して成長する貿易関係は、現在も依然として平和を維持する重要な後ろ盾となっている。

キーワード：貿易による平和、ロシアによるウクライナ侵略、中台の軍事的対立、兩岸貿易関係

貿易與和平：以俄羅斯與烏克蘭及 中國大陸與台灣為例的比較分析

張婷婷

(銘傳大學國際事務碩士 / 外交學士學位學程助理教授)

【摘要】

諾貝爾經濟學獎得主，保羅·克魯曼在紐約時報發表了一篇文章指出，西方國家在二次世界大戰之後致力於建構相互依賴的全球貿易體系以避免軍事衝突的理想與努力，在俄羅斯侵略烏克蘭以及中國對台灣步步進逼的軍事恐嚇之下，似乎逐漸喪失了說服力。現實主義與地緣政治理論點出經濟依賴的局限性以及貿易的不對稱，使得俄烏與中台之間不足以維持和平。因此，本研究以現實主義與地緣政治的批評觀點為出發點，比較貿易在兩個案例中的影響與轉變。研究結果指出，經濟依賴的局限性及貿易的不對稱確實存在於俄烏與中台之間。但是，中台之間的貿易關係長久以來緩和增長且無大變動。反之，烏克蘭則因為其發展策略的改變而影響了原本與俄羅斯之間的經貿與政治關係。比較兩個案例，穩定且成長的中台貿易關係成為台灣海峽兩岸之間目前還是維持和平的重要原因。

關鍵字：貿易與和平、俄烏戰爭、中國與台灣軍事對峙、兩岸貿易關係

Trade and Peace: A Comparative Analysis of Russia-Ukraine and China-Taiwan Relations

Ting-Ting Chang

Assistant Professor, International Affairs Master's/Diplomacy Bachelor's Programs, Ming Chuan University

【Abstract】

Paul Krugman, The Nobel Prize Winner in Economics, published an article in his column for the New York Times entitled, “Trade and Peace: The Great Illusion”. This article begins with how the western countries were devoted to building up a world order based upon free trade. It was believed that more integrated economies and interdependence on trade would reduce the possibility of military confrontations among countries. However, the Russia-Ukraine war and the China-Taiwan military tension doubted if trade does contribute to peace. Critics from Realism and geopolitics identify the problems of economic limitation and trade imbalance as the key to the ineffectiveness of trade in sustaining peace in the two cases. Based upon the critics of economic limitation and trade imbalance, this paper tries to compare the changing trading relations from the long-term perspective in the two cases. The comparison shows that economic limitation and trade imbalance do exist; however, a stable and steady-growing trade relation impacts the results differently. This changing trade relations between Russia and Ukraine increased trade disputes and security concerns, while on the contrary, the stable uprising trade relation across the Taiwan Strait sustains relative peace between China and Taiwan.

Keywords: trade for peace, Russia-Ukraine war, China-Taiwan military resistance, cross-strait trade relations

〈参考文献〉

- 中華民國統計資訊網、2011、2013、2015、2019、2021、2022、2023『統計年鑑』、
<https://www.stat.gov.tw/News.aspx?n=3093&sms=11160> (査閲時間：2024/10/27)。
National Statistics, R.O.C. (Taiwan). 2011, 2013, 2015, 2019, 2021, 2022, 2023. *Tongji nianjian [Statistical Yearbook of the Republic of China (Taiwan)]* (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- 國家統計局、1999、2001、2003、2005、2007、2009、2011、2013、2015、2019、2021
『中國統計年鑑』、<https://www.stats.gov.cn/sj/ndsjs/> (査閲時間：2024/10/27)。
National Bureau of Statistics, P.R.C. 1999, 2001, 2003, 2005, 2007, 2009, 2011, 2013, 2015, 2019, 2021. *Zhongguo tongji nianjian [Statistical Yearbook of China]* (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Ash, Timothy, Annette Bohr, Kateryna Busol and Keir Giles et al. 2023. “How to end Russia’s war on Ukraine.” *Chatham House*. https://www.chathamhouse.org/sites/default/files/2023-07/2023-06-27-how-end-russias-war-ukraine-ash-et-al_0.pdf (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Baldwin, David. A. 1985. *Economic Statecraft*. Princeton University Press.
- Barbieri, Katherine. 1996. “Economic Interdependence: A Path to Peace or a Source of Interstate Conflict?” *Journal of Peace Research*, 33(1): 29-49.
- Barbieri, Katherine, and Gerald Schneider. 1999. “Globalization and Peace: Assessing New Directions in the Study of Trade and Conflict.” *Journal of Peace Research*, 36(4): 387-404.
- Barbieri, Katherine. 2002. *The Liberal Illusion: Does Trade Promote Peace?* University of Michigan Press.
- Bush, Richard C. 2004. *At Cross Purposes: U.S.-Taiwan Relations Since 1942*. M.E. Sharpe.
- Chang, Kuo-I. and Kazunobu Hayakawa. 2014. “Details in the China-Taiwan Free Trade Agreement.” *Journal of Economic Integration*, 29(4): 676-699.
- Copeland, Dale C. 1996. “Economic Interdependence and War: A Theory of Trade Expectations.” *International Security*, 20(4): 5-41.
- Correlates of War. 2016. “National Material Capabilities.” <https://correlatesofwar.org/data-sets/> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- D’Anieri, Paul. 2023. *Ukraine and Russia: From Civilized Divorce to Uncivil War*. Cambridge University Press.
- Deudney, Daniel, and G. John Ikenberry. 2015. “America’s Impact: The End of Empire and the Globalization of the Westphalian System.” Working paper. <https://gji3.scholar.princeton.edu/sites/g/files/toruqf2666/files/gji3/files/am-impact-dd-gji-final-1-august-2015.pdf> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Dittmer, Lowell. 2017. *Taiwan and China*. University of California Press.
- Eurostat. “Europe Trade since 1988 Exports.” https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/databrowser/view/DS-045409__custom_13473399/default/table?lang=en (Accessed on October 27, 2024).

- Eurostat. “Europe Trade since 1988 Imports.” https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/databrowser/view/DS-045409_custom_13473622/default/table?lang=en (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Federal State Statistics. “Export and Import of Russian Trade.” <https://eng.rosstat.gov.ru/figures/activities> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Gartzke, Erik, Quan Li, and Charles Boehmer. 2001. “Investing in the Peace: Economic Interdependence and International Conflict.” *International Organization*, 55(2): 391-438.
- Gartzke, Erik, and Quan Li. 2003. “Measure for Measure: Concept Operationalization and the Trade Interdependence-Conflict Debate.” *Journal of Peace Research*, 40(5): 553-571.
- Gartzke, Erik. 2007. “The Capitalist Peace.” *American Journal of Political Science*, 51(1): 166-191.
- Global Firepower. 2024. “Global Firepower Ranking.” https://www.globalfirepower.com/#google_vignette (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Gustafson, Thane. 2023a. “Peace and the World--All on One Convenient Russian Debit Card.” April 21. <https://thanegustafson.substack.com/p/peace-and-the-world-all-on-one-convenient> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Gustafson, Thane. 2023b. “IN MEMORIAM: On the Destruction of the Kakhovka Dam in Ukraine’s Donbas.” December 17. (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Harding, Harry. 2009. “The Concept of ‘Greater China’: Themes, Variations and Reservations.” *The China Quarterly*, 136: 660-686.
- Henderson, James, and Tatiana Mitrova. 2015. “The Political and Commercial Dynamics of Russia’s Gas Export Strategy.” *The Oxford Institute for Energy Studies*. <https://www.oxfordenergy.org/wpcms/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/NG-102.pdf> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Högselius, Per. 2012. *Red Gas: Russia and the Origins of European Energy Dependence*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Ikenberry, G. John. 2018. “Why the Liberal World Order Will Survive.” *Ethics & International Affairs*. Spring: 17-29.
- International Monetary Fund. 2024. “World Economic Outlook Database.” <https://www.imf.org/en/Publications/WEO/weo-database/2024/April> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Kant, Immanuel, trans. by Ted Humphrey. 2006. “To Perpetual Peace: A Philosophical Sketch (1795)” *Perpetual Peace and Other Essays on Politics, History, and Morals*. pp. 107-143. Hackett Publishing.
- Keohane, Robert O., and Joseph. S. Nye. 1977. *Power and Interdependence: World Politics in Transition*. Little, Brown and Company.
- Krugman, Paul. 2022. “Trade and Peace: The Great Illusion.” *The New York Times*. April 11. <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/04/11/opinion/germany-russia-ukraine-trade-gas.html> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Lee, Yimou, and Martin Quin Pollard. 2022. “Pelosi set to visit Taiwan despite China warnings, sources say.” August 2, *Reuters*. <https://www.reuters.com/world/asia-pacific/pelosi-begins->

- closely-watched-asia-tour-singapore-2022-08-01/ (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Lo, Li-Chia. 2023. "Facilitating the Market with a Gift: The Politics of the ECFA between China and Taiwan (2008-2016)." *Asian Studies Review*, 47(3): 536-553.
- Macrotrends. "Russia Exports 1989-2024." <https://www.macrotrends.net/countries/RUS/russia/exports> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Macrotrends. "Russia Imports 1989-2024." <https://www.macrotrends.net/countries/RUS/russia/imports> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Macrotrends. "Ukraine Exports 1989-2024." <https://www.macrotrends.net/countries/UKR/ukraine/exports> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Macrotrends. "Ukraine Imports 1989-2024." <https://www.macrotrends.net/countries/UKR/ukraine/imports> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Mansfield, Edward. D., and Brian. M. Pollins. 2003. "Interdependence and Conflict: An Introduction." Edward Deering Mansfield and Brian M. Pollins, eds, *Economic Interdependence and International Conflict: New Perspectives on an Enduring Debate*, pp. 1-28. University of Michigan Press.
- Martin, Philippe, Thierry Mayer and Mathias Thoenig. 2008. "Make Trade not War?" *Review of Economic Studies*, 75(3): 865-900.
- Martin, Philippe, Thierry Mayer, and Mathias Thoenig. 2012. "The Geography of Conflicts and Free Trade Agreements." *American Economic Journal: Macroeconomics*, 4(4): 1-35.
- Mearsheimer, John. J. 2024. "Who Caused the Ukraine War." Working paper. August 5. <https://mearsheimer.substack.com/p/who-caused-the-ukraine-war> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Mearsheimer, John. J. 2023. "The Darkness Ahead: Where The Ukraine War Is Headed." Working Paper. June 24. https://mearsheimer.substack.com/p/the-darkness-ahead-where-the-ukraine?r=6o004&utm_campaign=post&utm_medium=web (Accessed on October 27, 2024).
- Nye, Joseph. S. 2023. *Soft Power and Great-Power Competition*. Springer Singapore.
- Oneal John R., and Bruce Russett. 1999. "Assessing the Liberal Peace with Alternative Specifications: Trade Still Reduces Conflict." *Journal of Peace Research*, 36(4): 423-442.
- Oneal John R., Frances H. Oneal, Zeev Maoz, and Bruce Russett. 1996. "The Liberal Peace: Interdependence, Democracy, and International Conflict, 1950-85." *Journal of Peace Research*, 33(1): 11-28.
- Pillsbury, Michael. 2015. *The Hundred-Year Marathon: China's Secret Strategy to Replace America as the Global Superpower*. Henry Holt and Company.
- Polachek, Solomon W., John Robst, and Yuan-Ching Chang. 1999. "Liberalism and Interdependence: Extending the Trade-Conflict Model." *Journal of Peace Research*, 36(4): 405-422.
- Posen, Barry R. 2022. "Ukraine's Implausible Theories of Victory: The Fantasy of Russian Defeat and the Case for Diplomacy." *Foreign Affairs*, 103(6). <https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/ukraine/2022-07-08/ukraines-implausible-theories-victory> (Accessed on

October 27, 2024).

Schneider, Gerald, Katherine Barbieri, and Nils Petter Gleditsch. 2003. "Does Globalization Contribute to Peace? A Critical Survey of the Literature." Gerald Schneider, Katherine Barbieri, and Nils Petter Gleditsch, eds. *Globalization and Armed Conflict*, pp. 3-30. Rowman & Littlefield.

State Statistics Service of Ukraine. "International Trade of Ukraine." <https://www.ukrstat.gov.ua/> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).

The Observatory of Economic Complexity. "China Exports, Imports and Trade Partners." <https://oec.world/en/profile/country/chn> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).

The Observatory of Economic Complexity. "Russia Exports, Imports and Trade Partners." <https://oec.world/en/profile/country/rus> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).

The Observatory of Economic Complexity. "Taiwan Exports, Imports and Trade Partners." <https://oec.world/en/profile/country/twn> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).

The Observatory of Economic Complexity. "Ukraine Exports, Imports and Trade Partners." <https://oec.world/en/profile/country/ukr> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).

Tucker, Nancy Bernkopf. 2011. *Strait Talk: United States-Taiwan Relations and the Crisis with China*. Harvard University Press.

Walt, Stephen. M. 2022. "Hard Power Still Matters." Harvard Kennedy School. Summer. <https://www.belfercenter.org/publication/hard-power-still-matters> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).

Wei, Shang-Jin, and Jeffrey Frankel. 1994. "A 'Greater China' trade Bloc?" *China Economic Review*, 5(2): 179-190.

World Bank. 2024. "World Development Indicators." <https://databank.worldbank.org/source/world-development-indicators> (Accessed on October 27, 2024).

Yekelchik, Serhy. 2020. *Ukraine: What Everyone Needs to Know*. Oxford University Press.

Zheng, Sarah. 2022. "China Plans Four Days of Military Drills in Areas Encircling Taiwan." *Bloomberg*. August 2 (Accessed on October 27, 2024).